https://doi.org/10.7592/FEJF2023.90.linno_lukas

MULTILINGUALISM IN ESTONIAN POETRY

Saara Lotta Linno
Junior Research Fellow in Comparative Literature
University of Tartu, Estonia
saara.lotta.linno@ut.ee

Liina Lukas
Professor of Comparative Literature
University of Tartu, Estonia
liina.lukas@ut.ee

Abstract: Apart from Estonian, some other languages – from local dialects to major languages such as German and Russian – have usually also been spoken on the territory of Estonia. As a result, the literary culture of the local (small) language evolved in close contact with some foreign literatures and cultures. However, there is still no thorough analysis of how the historical change in the linguistic situation manifests itself in Estonian literature. Our article aims to draw attention to the multilingual nature of the Estonian literary field by giving a historical survey of the relations, contacts, and intertwining of the languages used in Estonian poetry from the 17th century to the present. To reflect the multiple facets of multilingualism revealed in poetry we mainly use a four-level approach partly based on Jaan Undusk's typology of Estonian–German cultural contacts, adding the literary field as the level covering whatever is left. Thus, we treat multilingualism as a phenomenon observable within a language, text, author, and literary field. In terms of this study, intralinguistic multilingualism means language mixing in otherwise monolingual poetry, while intratextual multilingualism refers to abrupt transitions from one language to another (code-switching) within a text, and author multilingualism assumes a multilingual poet. Apart from the phenomena just mentioned, multilingualism within literature covers literary subfields in different language variants (for example literature created in South Estonian or Russian, but on Estonian territory). First, we will survey multilingualism in Estonia poetry before the Republic of Estonian was established in 1918, concluding that because German was the major cultural language up to the beginning of the 20th century, all poets, whatever their ethnicity, must have been fluent in two (or more) languages. The second period analysed spans the 20th century. The local Estonian poetry of the Soviet period stands out, with a few exceptions, for consistent use of Estonian, while some expatriate poets would also use English or Swedish. Third, we analyse contemporary poetry, where multilingualism is manifested not only by the use of local minority languages but also through intertwinings with English, Chinese or Japanese, thus giving evidence of an open society. Based on the picture emerging from the

article we can say that apart from a historical overview, the multilingualism of Estonian poetry also needs closer poetic analysis.

Keywords: Estonian poetry, literary contacts, multilingualism

Estonia has historically been, and still is, a multilingual country, which is also reflected in Estonian poetry. Several literary cultures have co-existed here side by side but, until recently, these have been the subject of separate disciplines and studies. Approaches to Estonian literary history so far have proceeded from "the monolingual paradigm" (Yildiz 2012) – Estonian literature has been viewed as literature written in the Estonian language (most recently, see the programmatic approach in Hasselblatt 2006: 2), and for that reason, texts in other languages have eluded research attention. In the past few decades, studies and overviews of Estonian literature in other languages have been published in Estonian in the form of approaches to Baltic-German poetry (e.g., Lukas 2006; Klöker 2014; Kaur 2009; 2011), poetry written in Latin (e.g., Viiding 2005, 2014; Viiding et al. 2007), in dialects (e.g., Velsker 2014, 2019, 2021a, 2021b), and Estonian Russian-language poetry (e.g., Sukhovei 2008; Belobrovtseva 2018a, 2020; Kotyukh 2020). However, all these studies have focused on a single language. It has long been suggested that Estonian literature should be studied from a regional perspective, as a common, shared multilingual literary culture, although the realisation of this approach has been held back by its complexity. Furthermore, in the reference companion *Balti kirjakultuuri ajalugu* (The History of Baltic Literary Culture) (Lukas 2021), the volume on poetry is still waiting to be published.

In compiling a regional multilingual literary history, the focus of research shifts to the interaction and intertwining of languages, reciprocal translations and transmissions, and manifestations of multilingualism in its various forms, all of which are marginal, sometimes altogether unnoticeable, aspects for a monolingual approach to literature.

Poetry that emerges from or transgresses language boundaries, switching from one language to another, has been created in the territory of Estonia through the ages. So far, language contacts in poetry have been explored in the context of Baltic-German literature (Kalda 2000; Aabrams 2007) and Russian-language literature published in Estonia (Belobrovtseva 2018b). However, multilingualism in poetry is increasingly widespread in Estonia today and merits further consideration. The first steps have been made: In 2019, a conference on multilingualism in Baltic and German literatures was held in Tartu, among the outcomes of which was the publication of a collection of articles in

German (Pajević 2020), and a special issue of the journal *Interlitteraria* on multilingualism and exophony in Baltic and German cultures (2021, vol. 26, no. 1), both of which aimed to integrate the Baltic experience into international multilingualism studies. Multilingualism has attracted considerable attention in the last decade, especially in German literary studies, where non-German writers, including poets (such as Japanese-born Yōko Tawada) have emerged to integrate the linguistic and poetic experience of their homeland into German poetry. A companion on this topic has now been published (Dembeck & Parr 2017). Of course, in the era of globalisation, multilingualism in its various forms is ubiquitous, impossible to ignore, and, as a result, has come to attract increasing interest among researchers. Then again, this interest has also resulted in revisiting seemingly monolingual texts, and in noticing the intertwining of languages in texts that were previously considered monolingual.

In this paper, we will explore multilingual phenomena in Estonian poetry. While a literary work can be regarded as inherently multilingual, with different codes intertwining and interchanging, we will leave aside the more complex cases of the intertwining of poetic languages (for example, in terms of different language registers), and consider language to mean natural languages, including slang and (social) dialects.

We will present an overview of the possible manifestations of multilingualism in Estonian (written[1]) poetry throughout its history. First, we will look at poetry before the birth of the Republic of Estonia, when the colonial situation in the region dictated the relationship between the local languages. We will then observe which previous manifestations of multilingualism continued to be relevant in the post-colonial situation, since the establishment of the Republic of Estonia, and how the Soviet period altered the distribution of languages in poetry. Finally, we will examine which manifestations of bilingualism can be distinguished in contemporary Estonian literature(s). More prominent manifestations of multilingualism will be highlighted from the historical to contemporary examples of multilingualism in poetry. The theoretical framework of the study is based, among others, on Jaan Undusk's 1992 typology of German–Estonian literary relations, which includes forms of bilingualism but can also be applied in the study of other linguistic relations in literature.

We distinguish between multilingualism on four levels[2]: in language, within the text, by the author, and in the literary field. Intralinguistic multilingualism is a grammatical mixing of languages rather than their alteration, with clearly distinct code-switching. Here a distinction can be made between the use or imitation of an existing linguistic variant (for example, "*ja nüüd siis küsibki ta minult oma toreda / ajuti aimatava aktsendiga: / kas teie ei kavatsegi endale DAKTARIKRAADI teha?*" (And now he asks me in his cute/occasionally

noticeable accent: / aren't you going to get yourself a *DACTARAL* DEGREE?"[3]) (Kivisilla 2019: 25), and the macaronic use of the grammar, lexis, concepts, and phraseological expressions of another language in poetry (for example, in a poem by Kristiina Ehin Estonian and Russian are used in the same sentence: "*neis silmis tuhamägedele üles / siis läksime* на санках *me* кататься" (Ehin 2000: 19)).

Intratextual multilingualism can be defined as an alteration of languages within a text without adapting one language to the syntax or morphology of another. There is an abrupt switch from one language to another, whereas both languages serve a specific cultural function in the text.[4] Author-based multilingualism means that the author of a text uses several languages when writing, with one text in one language and another text in another. Authors who have grown up in a multilingual family or have changed their language of creation after migrating to a new environment have become increasingly common in today's globalised world. This has come to be termed 'exophony' (*Anderssprachigkeit*, see, e.g., Arndt et al. 2007).

In terms of literary multilingualism[5], Estonian literature is viewed as a shared multilingual literary field (see Lukas 2006: 26), including subfields in different languages; these are interrelated both through common institutions (for example, publishing houses, societies, journalism, school education, theatre, etc.) and through indirect contact, for example, translations, reception, thematic allusions, reciprocal references or shared mentalities (see also Undusk 1992). Parts of the literary field may also overlap, for example, in poets' collaborations when creating parallel texts, such as *Целлюлоза / Tselluloos* (2015), co-authored by P. I. Filimonov and Katrin Väli in Russian and Estonian.

Literary multilingualism is also furthered by contact with world literature, which is seen as a guarantee for the development of a small literary culture (see, e.g., Talvet 2005). While contact of this kind are outside the focus of this study, falling rather under the scope of translation and reception studies, in the context of literary multilingualism studies, we should mention here poetry collections that contain the original creation and reciprocal translations by Estonian- and non-Estonian-speaking poets and which bring together bilingual (parallel) texts from the works of authors from different cultural backgrounds. A particularly versatile work in this regard is *白い火 / Kuitund / The If Hour* (2010), which includes poems by Andres Ehin and Fujitomi Yasuo in Estonian, English, and Japanese. The book's layout allows the reader to start reading both from front to back, as is usual in the Estonian language, or from back to front, as is common in Japanese so that either cover is both the front and the back of the book, and the text is correctly oriented when read in either direction. This simple nuance makes the book appropriate for both the Estonian and

the Japanese printing tradition, thereby allowing the texts of the poets to be perceived simultaneously in a familiar and a foreign context.

The overview given below focuses on examples of intralinguistic, intratextual, and author-based multilingualism in Estonian poetry.

TYPES OF MULTILINGUALISM IN POETRY BEFORE THE INDEPENDENT REPUBLIC OF ESTONIA

Among the languages and their varieties that have historically been used for writing in the territory of Estonia are Latin, Low German, German, South Estonian, North Estonian, Russian, Swedish, Polish, Greek, French, and, less frequently, others. Authors writing in these languages often used another language in speech or as their mother tongue, and the choice of language was based on the function and audience of the composed text. These authors were proficient in several languages and often used them interchangeably in speech and writing. The distribution, functions, and hierarchies of local languages varied, depending on social and political trends. Before the 16th century, the most prestigious written language was Latin, which since around the end of the 14th century was gradually superseded by Low German, which, in turn, was replaced by High German by the beginning of the 17th century. Indeed, the earliest poetic texts from this area are either in Latin or Low German. Latin and Greek rose to prominence as languages of poetry in the first half of the 17th century among the local academic circles, the members of which used to write poems in several languages. The very first poems in Estonian (North or South Estonian variety) were written in this very humanistic tradition.

Until the mid-nineteenth century, the Estonian literary field was predominantly German-language. Then, an Estonian-language subfield began to emerge, which was divided, in turn, into South and North Estonian (both language varieties were also used in poetry[6]). The German language used in the area was in a constant state of flux, borrowing from both written and locally spoken oral (Estonian, Latvian, and Russian) languages. This gave rise to a new variant, called Baltic German, which was mainly a spoken language and had very fluid boundaries, ranging from the locally coloured and regionally idiosyncratic manner of speaking by Germans to the ways Estonians and Latvians spoke German. Baltic German speakers continued to use High German in their writing so that they could be understood in Germany. In the 19th century, Baltic German began to be used, to some extent, in writing, especially for composing poetry.

A Russian minority has lived on the territory of Livonia and Estonia since the early Middle Ages, but its proportion among the total population used to be tiny, rising to 5% only in the late 19th century. The minority was largely made up of peasants, Old Believers who had settled in the shore areas of Lake Peipus in the late 17th century. They had a peculiar relationship with literary culture: although they spoke a special dialect with archaic elements, they read and wrote in Church Slavonic. Despite the fact that Estonia and Livonia had become part of the Russian Empire at the beginning of the 18th century, German continued to be the main language of imperial institutions in administrative matters, while Russian translations were used for communication between the central and local authorities. The teaching of the Russian language in schools became more systematic under Catherine the Great's viceroyalty (1783–1796). Since the early 19th century, in connection with the re-establishment of the university in Tartu, Russian became more prominent in the literary sphere, as an increasing number of Russian-language publications, initiated by Russian students, were published here (Lukas 2021: 15–19).

The mid-eighteenth century saw an increase in the use of French, which was the language of education throughout Europe, was used as a written language at the Russian imperial court, and may also have been used for writing poetry.

Multilingualism, the availability of choice between different literary languages, became a characteristic feature of Estonian literature. Until the end of the 19th century, poets, regardless of their ethnic background, were at least bilingual. They had been educated in German but also wrote poetry in Estonian, Latvian, and occasionally in French or Russian.

Examples of author-based multilingualism in the poetry of the Baltic countries, such as the parallel use of German and Latin, date back to the Middle Ages and the Early Modern period. In seventeenth-century occasional poetry, the use of different languages was almost programmatic. The first Estonian-language poem was also a result of the humanistic practice of writing poetry in several languages. In 1637, Reiner Brockmann, a German from Mecklenburg, wrote a poem in Estonian alongside other poems in Greek, Latin, and German, giving it the Latin title *Carmen alexandrinum esthonicum ad leges Opitij poeticas compositum* and using a poem in German praising the Estonian language (*Andre mögn ein anders treiben* (Others May Do Otherwise)) as an introduction to the Estonian poem. The Estonian Kristian Jaak Peterson and the German Georg Julius Schultz-Bertram wrote poetry in both Estonian and German, and even as late as at the beginning of the 20th century, Aksel Kallas, a native Estonian poet, composed poetry in both German (*Am Moor* (On the Moor), 1912 and *Nervenvibrierungen im Tintengewande: Futuro-kubistisches* (Nerve Vibrations in the Guise of Ink: Future-cubist), 1920) and Estonian (*Au*

langenuile! Tänuhelid ja troostihääled (Glory to the Fallen Ones! Sounds of Gratitude and Voices of Comfort), 1922).

There is less intratextual multilingualism in poetry (code-switching within a single text), although it is quite common in other areas of literary creation. This phenomenon can be traced back to seventeenth-century ecclesiastical texts (for example, Georg Müller's sermon notes from 1600–1608, which demonstrate a smooth transition from Estonian to German or Latin). A pioneering example from the 18th century is August von Kotzebue's play *Die väterliche Erwartung* (Fatherly Expectations) (1789): the third act of the play, which is predominantly in German, begins with a dialogue in Estonian, and all the parallel action performed by the servants is in Estonian. Intratextual multilingualism can also be found in the correspondence of nineteenth-century Estonian intellectuals.

Intralinguistic multilingualism – the merging of two languages into a single sociolect – has led to rather unique results in poetry. While in written use authors tried to keep the languages separate, in oral use the interaction between them was lively and the transitions smooth, and depending on the situation of use and the social position of the speakers, sometimes transformed into pidgin as intermediate or transitional variants (*Kleindeutsch*, *Halbdeutsch*, *kadaka-sakslane* (juniper German), as well as local Russian varieties). Baltic German, with its slang and sociolects, was one such variety of pidgin language: a more or less creolised German in an Estonian- or Latvian-speaking environment, used by local Germans who adopted Estonian or Latvian words and expressions in their speech. The language variant that had evolved over centuries separately from the language spoken in Germany acquired a distinctive accent. (Bender 2022) The Baltic German variety with all its jargon served a comedic function in poetry, resulting in nineteenth-century literature in the so-called "*Halbdeutsch* poetry", which has been considered Baltic-German macaronic poetry (Kalda 2000; Aabrams 2007).

The first and most popular example of such poetry is '*Die Oberpahlsche Freundschaft*' (Friendship in Põltsamaa, 1818/1857) by Jacob Johann Malm from Tallinn:

Vart', tenkt' ich mal in meine Sinn,
Willst wahren toch heinmal
Su Wreind nach Oberpalen in!
Und ging nu in tas Tall[7]*,*

Und nehmt tas Wuchs mit lange Wanz
Und pannt tas wor tas Saan[8]*;*

Tann nehmt' ich meine Mütz und Ans
Und wangt' su jagen an;

Und nu katsait turch Tuchk und Tolm[9]
Ich tuhhat neljad[10] *wort,*
Und wie tas Wind war üks, kaks, kolm[11]
Ich an tas Tell und Ort.

Vart', tenkt ich, willst toch machen Paß
Mit oberpalse Wreind!
Tu willst ihm trehen lange Nas';
Laß sehn, was tas toch meint!
(Malm 1861: 3)

The poem's protagonist is not a Baltic-German, but a German-speaking Estonian, a snobbish semi-literate person representing a certain social personality type, who used to be disparagingly called a *Wacholderdeutscher* ('juniper German'). Such people wished to break out of the boundaries of their nationality, as well as of their status and the social roles assigned to it, and used the more prestigious German language, though incorrectly, to boast about education or success. The author's perspective of this character is comical, and he uses irony to depict people's snobbish attempts to rise above their identity.

Bilingualism functions as a poetic device in Malm's poem: two languages are used together for a comic or parodying effect. The syntax and morphology of High German are used as the base language, with added Estonian words; the poem's German phonology is adapted to that of Estonian so that, for example, voiced consonants are replaced by voiceless consonants, or consonant compounds are stripped of vowels so as to be more convenient for native Estonians to pronounce the words (see Ariste 1981).

An analogous linguistic variant, but in reverse – with German words and expressions sprinkled into Estonian text and adapted to Estonian grammar – can be also found in Estonian literature. A fairly common example of that is the character Kniks-Mariihen in August Kitzberg's *Veli Henn* (Brother Henn) (1901):

"Bitte," ütles Mariihen. "Astuge aita, sääl on toolisid, ja võite ennast natuke erhoolida." [---]
"Herr Lehepuu, üks väga peenike kawalier, – herr Birkenbaum, minu Freundini Bräutigam, – herr Sissa, minu Tänzer, kui Vereinis ball oli, – herr Enilane, ka üks hää Tänzer…"

> ("*Bitte*," said Mariihen. "There are some chairs in the barn, where you can *erholen* for a while." […]
> "*Herr* Lehepuu, a very fancy *Kawalier*, – *Herr* Birkenbaum, the *Bräutigam* of my *Freundin*, – *Herr* Sissa, my *Tänzer*, from that ball in *Verein*, – *Herr* Enilane, another fine *Tänzer*…")
> (Kitzberg 1915: 18–19)

In both of the above examples, the target of the parody is the same social personality type, as well as the attitude towards such snobbery; the desire to present a different identity than what one currently possesses is similarly ironic. Compared to Baltic German literature, this phenomenon is quite rare in Estonian literature in general, and no such linguistic variant is found in Estonian poetry.

In addition to Estonian/Latvian and German, Baltic-German macaronic poetry sometimes adopted words in Russian or French that were also used as concepts in the local German language.

Of course, there are also more random cases of the intertwining of another language in poetry. One of the early examples is a fragment from Paul Fleming's poem '*Liefflándische Schneegräfin*' (The Livonian Snow Princess), in which Low German and Estonian words are mixed into the German substrate:

> *Die Braut, bald rot, bald blaß, fing endtlich an zu reden:*
> *Wat schal ich arme Kind. Gott wet, wat sy my theden!*
> *Das ander, Ycks, Kacks, Koll*[12]*, hub sie auff Undeutsch an,*
> *Das ich noch nicht versteh', und auch kein Gott nicht kan.*
> (Fleming 1636)

At the beginning of the 20th century, words in Estonian can be found, for example, in the works of Maurice von Stern (see his poem with the title in Estonian '*Jaanililled, kullerkuppud*' (St John's Flowers, Globeflowers), where the title is repeated as a refrain at the end of each verse (Stern 1911: 88)).

POSTCOLONIAL MULTILINGUALISM IN ESTONIA

The evolution of the monolingual paradigm in the Baltic States was on the one hand technical and functional – it was a precondition for the emergence of a public literary sphere – and on the other hand political, i.e., an example of postcolonial emancipation (see also Dembeck 2021: 43). The birth of the Republic of Estonia instated Estonian as the country's official language and, with

that, made it available for use in all spheres of life, including those in which it had not been widely used until then, such as science. Estonian was yet to be established in science at university, so in academic circles, the use of German and Russian continued for a while alongside Estonian, but the transition to Estonian in research and education was consistent.

In reality, multiple languages remained in parallel use for some time. The population was multilingual (8% Russians, 1.7% Germans) and could speak the "three local languages" (Estonian, German, and Russian). The Act on cultural autonomy for national minorities (Hasselblatt 1997: 37–46), which was exemplary in world practice, also allowed the preservation and development of journalism, societies, and schools in German and Russian, as well as a local German-language literary (sub)field. Despite the rather marginal German-speaking minority, Estonian publishing houses and German-language periodicals continued to publish poetry in German until their resettlement in 1939 (see Lukas 2002).

The resettlement of the Baltic Germans as a result of the Hitler–Stalin Pact, the ulterior aim of which was to subordinate Eastern Europe to Germany not only politically but also culture- and language-wise, instead marks the end of Estonian–German bilingualism in Eastern Europe as well as in Estonia. Within a short space of time, this event deprived German of the status of second language and the main language of science and education, which it had enjoyed until then in (not only) the Baltic States. From then on, German was hardly ever used in Estonian literature. Only isolated words, sentences, quotations, or strophes can be found in the poetry of Jaan Kross, Ene Mihkelson, Mats Traat, Jaan Kaplinski, and others. The use of German in poetry texts was either references to cultural history, to a shared cultural heritage, or, as in the poem '1944 II' by Jaan Kross, to the Second World War.

Writers in exile also rarely used German (Urve Karuks, for example, began writing poetry in German and Estonian in a German refugee camp). An exception here is the poetry of Ivar Ivask. He was born in Riga in 1927 and grew up in a family where German was spoken next to Estonian (by his father) and Latvian (by his mother). Influenced by Rainer Maria Rilke, he wrote his first poems in German at the age of 16. In 1944, Ivask migrated to Germany, attended the University of Marburg, and later became professor of comparative literature at the University of Oklahoma. He wrote poetry in Estonian, English (the collection *Baltic Elegies*, 1987), and German (*Gespiegelte Erde*, 1967). In the preface to Ivask's collection of poems in German, Herbert Eisenreich argues that Ivask introduced something new to German poetry with this book, and elaborates further:

> *His poems in the German language acquire* […] *their unique quality and a double value of sensibility and expression most likely in and through the process of* [language] *acquisition: in this still foreign idiom, nothing is for granted, everything comes through costly, desperate conquests – and it is precisely through this process that he transcends the limits of conventionality (for example, with his downright shameless assemblage of word stems, or the innocent reclaiming of the imagery of seemingly overused figures of speech). Or, in other words: I notice that a foreigner is speaking my mother tongue and that in this fleeting foreignness the language sounds literally unheard of, and regains its virginal purity through this fleeting foreignness. And in its foreign accent, this language conveys more to me than it would in my own routine practice.* […] *these verses show how elsewhere, in foreign countries, one finds himself. And vice versa.* (Eisenreich 1967: 6–7)

Following the Second World War, as many Estonian authors found themselves exiled in Sweden, the US, Canada, Australia, or elsewhere, multilingualism in Estonian literature became a phenomenon that mainly characterised exile literature. While the first generation of writers in exile wrote predominantly in Estonian, the second generation, i.e., those who had been expatriated as children, began to use both languages in their work. Elin Toona wrote the novel *Lotukata* (1969) in Estonian and English (under the title *In Search of Coffee Mountains*). Urve Karuks wrote poetry in Estonian and English, Karin Saarsen in Estonian and Swedish. Saarsen's last collection of poetry, *The Lion and the Orchid* (2002), includes poems in Estonian, Swedish, English, and German. Text-level multilingualism also increasingly appeared in literature, often in the form of quotations or mottos in other languages, as in multiple of Karl Ristikivi's poems in the cycle "Hårsfjärden", for example *'Minagi olin Arkaadia teel'* (I too was heading to Arcadia), the motto of which is borrowed from the poem 'Sing me a song of a lad that is gone' by Robert Louis Stevenson. The generation born in exile seldom used Estonian as the language to compose poetry, and instead preferred to use the language of the host country.

In Soviet Estonia, against all the attempts of the authorities to strengthen the use of Russian in all areas, education managed to continue in Estonian at all levels. The western part of the Soviet Union represents a good case study for observing how languages respond to and, in turn, influence historical-political changes. The coerced transition to the Russian language by any kind of (educational) political measures led to a closer guard being kept over Estonian. The internal protest of this cultural field against the imposed language transition also explains the low representation of Russian in Estonian poetry

(and literature in general). Although Estonians had good Russian-speaking skills and Russian–Estonian bilingualism was very common in everyday life, Estonian–Russian bilingualism in literature was rare.

Eha Lättemäe, who learned Finnish by listening to radio programs and also began to write poetry in Finnish, is unique because of her use of Finnish–Estonian bilingualism in poetry (her collections in Finnish *Uskon aurinkoon* (I Believe in the Sun, 1969), and *Poimin marjoja sinisestä metsästä* (I Pick Berries in the Blue Forest, 1975), were published in Karelia). Her later poems in Estonian are translations of the Finnish ones.

MULTILINGUALISM IN CONTEMPORARY ESTONIAN LITERATURE(S)?

According to the 2021 national census, the most common second languages spoken by residents of Estonia in addition to Estonian were English, Russian, Finnish and German (see Statistikaamet 2022). As studies on contact linguistics (e.g., Verschik 2012) have shown, Estonians often combine several languages in their everyday speech. As in the past, contemporary literature also reflects the social and everyday language situation. The languages of Estonian poetry, however, have changed: in contemporary poetry, Estonian most often intertwines with Russian, English, and various Estonian dialects. German is represented in contemporary poetry, with a few exceptions, as a special cultural layer in the form of concepts, citations, and phraseological expressions. Contemporary Estonian poetry often also interacts with Finnish, as well as with the Romanic and classical languages. Asian languages have a notable role, for example, in Kalju Kruusa's poetry collection *灵血茶(ing•veri•tee)* (ging•er•tea), Estonian overlaps with Chinese ("*viibin lennujaama väravas / olen juba kiiresti (magnethylukrongi)ga / teinud hiinale pika ja pehme pai*" (I am at the airport gate / I have already, quickly with a *磁浮列车* (maglev train) / softly caressed China') (Kruusa 2013: 40)) as well as with Japanese, both in Kruusa's original texts and in poems translated from the two languages. The intertwining of a distant and a local language could be seen more generally as characteristic of an open society, in which language proficiency no longer necessarily depends on the speaker's geographical neighbours or the predominant (foreign) language.

Estonian literature in Russian and in the South Estonian dialect have established themselves as part of the Estonian literary culture. In light of this article, two facts are of particular interest here. First, how and to what extent do literary cultures in different languages overlap each other, especially in terms of the texts and authors who switch between them – both of which will

be addressed below. Second, it appears that, although Estonian is still regarded as a minor language, in some aspects of the relations of literary cultures in different languages it sometimes acquires the role of a major language. As already mentioned, Estonian literary history has been largely based on monolingualism. Therefore, the literary criticism that monitors and shapes the functioning of Estonian literary culture prioritises Estonian literature, which means that the reception of Estonian literature in Russian may be delayed until its translation is published in Estonian. In addition, when the translations do later appear, they tend to invite a more politically focused reception than literature originally written in Estonian (on the reception of Estonian Russian-language literature see, e.g., Kotyukh 2013). For instance, only one review was published in Estonian following the publication of Jaan Kaplinski's book of poems *Белые бабочки ночи* (White Butterflies of Night) (2014), and wider reception was delayed until the Estonian translation titled *Valged ööliblikad. Wegeneri naeratus* (White Butterflies of Night: Wegener's Smile) was issued in 2018. There is, however, hope that the audience's receptiveness is changing because an increasing number of studies and reviews are being published on Estonian Russian-language literature as well as on dialect literature. Furthermore, in the literary magazine Looming, most authors participating in the recent discussion mapping twenty-first-century Estonian literature ('*Mõttevahetus: XXI sajandi eesti kirjandus*'), most discussants mention Russian-language literature as a non-excludable part of Estonian literature (see, for example, Kraavi 2022: 263–264; Väljataga 2021: 1416; Velsker 2022: 121; Viires 2022: 549; Pilv 2022: 1706).

Among the poets writing mainly in Estonian, there are some who also compose in some other language. For example, Kätlin Kaldmaa's poetry alternates between Estonian and English. Jaan Kaplinski's poetry exhibits the broadest range of multilingualism – he was one of the few Estonian poets to publish original work in more than three languages. Since Kaplinski's poetry deserves a separate study, especially from the angle of multilingualism, we will consider here just a few highlights of this linguistic exploration.[13] In 1991, Kaplinski's first collection of poems written entirely in another language, *I am the Spring in Tartu and Other Poems Written in English*, was published in Vancouver. Among his subsequent collections, *Öölinnud, öömõtted* (Nocturnal Birds, Nocturnal Thoughts, 1998) included texts in English and Finnish in addition to Estonian, and in 2005 the Estonian, South Estonian and Russian book *Sõnad sõnatusse*. *Инакобытие* (Words into Wordlessness: *Existing Otherwise*) was published. In 2010, Kaplinski published the text 'Goodbye my Estonian' on his blog, in which he promised to stop writing in Estonian (Kaplinski 2010). Which he also did. However, as Mikhail Trunin (2018: 18) has noted, Kaplinski's promise held true specifically in poetry, as he continued to publish his other

writings in Estonian. Following this change of language, Kaplinski published one collection of poetry in the South Estonian dialect (*Taivahe heidet tsirk* (A Bird Cast into Heaven), 2012), after which he changed both his pen name and language, and the next three books of poems were published in Russian under the name Ян Каплинский – *Белые бабочки ночи* (White Butterflies of Night, 2014), *Улыбка Вегенера* (Wegener's Smile, 2017) and *Наши тени так длинны* (Our Shadows Are Very Long, 2018).

Poet Igor Kotyukh, whose Russian-language debut collection *Когда наступит завтра?* (When Will Tomorrow Come?, 2005) was followed by the collection of poems in Estonian *Teises keeles* (In Another Language, or In the Second Language, 2007), went through a reverse route. Kotyukh has consistently made sure that his texts are available in both Russian and Estonian, translating his poems both himself and in collaboration with Estonian-speaking poets. Irina Belobrovtseva (2018b: 18) argues that such parallel creative existence is not at all common: multilingual authors often create their texts as original works in one language or another, but do not engage in their constant mediation into other languages. In an interview with Ekaterina Yashina, Kotyukh mentions that, when writing his poems, he already considers how a text would work in another language (Yashina 2019: 57–58). Kotyukh's earlier work tends to be essayistic, brief, and monolingual throughout, addressing multilingualism primarily at the level of content. "*On emakeel / ja teine keel. // Aga inimene / on sama*" (There's mother tongue / and the other tongue. // But the person / is the same) (Kotyukh 2007: 31). In his later work, the poet began to blur clear boundaries between the two languages, publishing poems using intralinguistic multilingualism as a structural tool. One of the most fascinating examples is the prose poem '*14 юния*' (14th of June), which is published in the same way in the original collection *Естественно особенный случай* (A Naturally Special Incident) as well as in Aare Pilve's translation into Estonian *Loomulikult eriline lugu*: "*рягиме эриневайд кеэли, куйд олеме икка неэдсамад инимесед, тейнетейсе пеэглид йа пеэгельдусед*"[14] (Kotyukh 2017a: 75, 2017b: 73). The only differences between the two published poems are the language and spelling of the title.

There are also other authors in Estonian contemporary literature who have acquired Estonian as a second language, such as Adam Cullen from the US and Øyvind Rangøy from Norway. Cullen's *Lichen / Samblik* (2017) is bilingual, containing both original parallel texts (their peculiarities will be discussed below) and monolingual poems. Rangøy's *Sisikond* (Viscera) (2019) is almost entirely in Estonian, although it does include an example of intratextual multilingualism. The poem 'Kodeveksling. Koodivahetus' (Code-switching) reflects the experience of a bilingual subject once they have finally acquired the language

that seemed unattainable: "*Olen eesti keeles ka olemas* // [---] *Lugu, mis kunagi kaugel / mere ja okastraadi taga vaid virvendas, on nüüd ka minu* // Eg lever på to språk. Slik er det." (I am also present in the Estonian language // […] The story, which once, far away/only flickered beyond the sea and the barbed wire, is now mine too // *I live in two languages. This is how it is*.) (Rangøy 2019: unpaginated p. 15) Furthermore, Rangøy's text puts the Estonian reader, who does not speak Norwegian, in a situation where meaning flickers behind the language barrier: the code-switching in this poem is consistent with the idea being expressed even if the language (or not knowing the language) prevents one from understanding the meaning of the text.

Two closely related issues have frequently been addressed in relation to contemporary multilingual poets. First, the reasons that lead a poet to switch languages are explored. Code-switching is often justified as an attempt to expand the audience, but the reasons are usually more complex. Since the 1990s, English has been used in Estonian song lyrics, among other reasons to make the songs more accessible to Western audiences, although such a rationale for language change has not prevailed in the printed word. For example, Kätlin Kaldmaa, who writes poetry in English, considers the language of her work an aspect of little importance: "[…] I just write, without holding myself back, without getting stuck in the words, as it is given and as it comes, and the text can later be revised in the right language. So the initial versions of my writings may include sentences composed of three languages" (Kaldmaa 2020: 13). Irina Belobrovtseva (2018b: 14–15, 20), who has studied code-switching between Estonian and Russian in literature, has argued that creative multilingualism can be motivated by a number of complex reasons, including, for example, emotional affinity to another culture, language as a form of escapism, but also as postmodernist play.

Second, there has often been a debate about the literary context in which Estonian authors who write in several languages should be viewed – partly, apparently, because of the assumption that the target audience for writers in another language does not speak Estonian and is therefore non-Estonian. According to research done by Igor Kotyukh (2012, 2013, 2020), it is possible to distinguish between three approaches to contextualising multilingual authors: considering authors writing in a second language as (special) representatives of Estonian literature; viewing them in the context of the language in which they mainly write; or considering multilingual authors as inherently cosmopolitan, transnational, i.e., authors of world literature. However, national literary definitions inevitably entail political issues. After Jaan Kaplinski's turning point in 2010, there has been much debate about how to categorise the work of his latest period. Juxtaposing Kaplinski's political activities (he was an MP in

the 7th *Riigikogu*) with his creation, Sirje Olesk (2014) has concluded that in both respects Kaplinski was an emigrant who did not emigrate, who constantly swam against the tide. Ene-Reet Soovik (2016) suggests the same, arguing that Kaplinski used to write in languages that were less "popular" at the time, and which, for the most part, could not be counted on for expanding the audience. The delay in the reception of *Белые бабочки ночи* fits into this context well. Aare Pilv (2018: 139), in his afterword to *Valged ööbliblikad. Wegeneri naeratus*, has speculated that a writer is first and foremost part of the literature of the language in which he or she is read, the author's affiliation is determined by the receiving community. Since it appears that it is code-switching itself – rather than a cleverly conceived aim or attempt to become part of more than one poetry culture – that prompts the expansion of the audience, perhaps it is also worth considering, as far as multilingual poets are concerned, how code-switching affects their work in the artistic sense. In other words, the work of multilingual authors should be viewed from the perspective of multilingualism, not of monolingualism.

Typically, questions about a writer's linguistic affiliation do not emerge as readily in the case of poets who speak mainly Estonian and whose work is intratextually or intralinguistically multilingual. Perhaps the reason for this is that there are not many collections in contemporary literature that are entirely multilingual at the language or text level. The exception here are the texts and collections in which the parallel bilingual presentation of a poem serves as a completely original text without a distinction made between the original and the translation – the phenomenon of parallel texts. This has been pointed out in relation to Kalju Kruusa's (2013: 43–44) cycle of poems *Tali ja lumi* (Winter and Snow), in which Estonian and Japanese run in parallel. Both languages form a homogeneous whole in the poetry cycle and are part of a single text and its means of expression (see Lotman 2014: 308). A trio of texts, 'THE SUN', 'THE SUN (albescent version)', and 'THE SUN (albescent version): Berk Vaher's o sole dada dub', from Aare Pilv's collection *Päike ehk päike* (The Sun or the Sun) quite obviously function in the same way. The first is a poem in Estonian (for the most part), the second is entirely in English, and the third extensively mixes English and Portuguese (or, in fact, "dubious Portuguese") (see Pilv 1998: 23, 25, 47). The Estonian text is presented first and, regardless of the title, functions as an original text; the other two are kinds of intertextual remixes of the first. The texts thus point out the various linguistic possibilities of realising an idea, the apparent and actual similarities and differences between these possibilities, and also reflect the title of the poetry collection – *Päike ehk päike*.

The meaning of parallel texts depends on readers' language skills: if the reader understands the two languages set side by side, the poem's meaning may be revealed on the boundary of the two different languages, where the expressible and inexpressible emerge in either language. For example, in Adam Cullen's bilingual poem, the verse "*Oled täna / sõnaline, / aga napilt, / katsumustest / karastunud*" corresponds to the parallel English poem on the same page: "You're tied / today / by tongue, / trained by / tribulation" (Cullen 2017: 29). However, a parallel text may also appeal to a reader who speaks only one language: in the Japanese-Estonian cycle, published in Kruusa's collection, most readers are likely to read primarily the Estonian part, and the Japanese text acquires a graphic rather than a linguistic meaning.

The methods of using intratextual and intralinguistic multilingualism in contemporary Estonian poetry are more varied, however. Neither type of multilingualism is the main creative method used by any of the best-known contemporary poets, although most poets do employ both techniques from time to time. Although the following examples are mainly retrieved from poetry that is generally written or published in Estonian, it is likely that the same set of methods can be found in poetry written in all the locally spoken languages. For example, the chapter on language poetry titled '*Kiil kõnõlas*' (The Language Speaks) in the collection *Kõnõla mõtsan mädänü puuga* (Speak With a Rotten Tree in the Forest) by Evar Saar (2014) contains poems in South Estonian dialect that are characterised by the use of similar methods.

The most remarkable manifestation of multilingualism in contemporary poetry is the use of quotations and loans from other languages. In these cases, using the original language maintains a strong connection with the original context. Extensive use of this method can be found in the works of Sveta Grigoryeva, who writes mainly in Estonian. At the same time, it is closely embedded with the language and references of contemporary culture: "*mina olengi selle põlvkonna esindamiseks nagu iga teinegi / lihtsalt liiga eriline sest* / the only thing thats bigger than my ego is my mirror / bitch" (indeed I am, like any other person, for representing this generation / simply too special because / the only thing that's bigger than my ego is my mirror / bitch) (Grigoryeva 2020 [2013]: 47; the line "the only thing..." is quoted from rapper A$AP Rocky's song "Wassup"). The word loans appear, among other things, as words without translation equivalent (as neologisms) in Estonian (for example, "exgirlfriendilikult kummitav / mahajäetud industriaalsus" (*exgirlfriendlily* haunted / abandoned industrialism), Grigoryeva 2020 [2013]: 26) or as vulgarisms in other languages (for example, "teiste luulet viitsin harva lugeda / (see peab ikka selline pizdets luule olema et / peale teist rida jätkaksin […]" (I rarely bother to read other

people's poetry / (it must be such *fucked* poetry for / me to continue after the second line […]) (Grigoryeva 2020 [2013]: 66)).

Other poets who often use devices of multilingualism are Maarja Kangro and the abovementioned Kalju Kruusa. Both are poets and translators who, in their original creation, relate Estonian primarily to major world languages. In addition to borrowing quotations from other languages, their poems often take place in a foreign language setting. The setting can move away from Estonian language in terms of geography, as in Kruusa's poem '*Shanghai muuseumis*' (In a Museum in Shanghai): "*imestan miks ei teha / takitorudelegi 火纹(tulekirja) / lennukitiibadelegi 透雕(ažuur)set 云纹(pilvekirja)"* (I wonder why they don't make / *火纹*(fire signs) on tank guns / or even *透雕*(azure) *云纹*(cloud signs) on aeroplane wings) (Kruusa 2013: 38), and in Kangro's poem '*Tikitud kõht*' (The Embroidered Belly): "*töpatunde ma põlgasin* [---] / *vahetusõpilasena torinos* / *via garibaldil poekest nähes* / lavori femminili / *nõelad ja vardad* / *mõtlesin kas akent sisse pole visatud*" (I despised the crafts classes at school […] / as an exchange student in Turin / seeing the shop on Via Garibaldi / *women's work* / the needles and knitting needlesrods / wondering if someone had not broken in through the window) (Kangro 2019: 84). Sometimes distance from the native language is obtained on an intellectual level, as things can exist differently in different languages: "*kassid ütlevad hiina toonidega* niao[15] / *kassid suudavad* / / *niikuinii jätkuda* […] / *emakeel ei meigi senssi* / / *tuleks enestelgi* / *näugumisele üle minna*" (cats say *niao* in Chinese tones / cats can // last anyway […] / mother tongue does not make sense // we should ourselves start / meowing, too) (Kruusa 2010: 50); "*varsti sain teada, et* / жизнь *ja* смерть *on naised* / *ja et sünd on kesksoost* / *ja ma nägin, et see õige on* / *mõne aja pärast selgus, et* / *eriti õiged on romaani keeled:* / la nascita la morte la vita / la naissance la mort la vie" (I soon learned that / *life* and *death* are feminine / and that birth is neutral / and I saw that this is right / after a while it became clear that / romance languages especially are the right ones: / birth death life / birth death life) (Kangro 2013: 52).

In contemporary poetry, both intralinguistic and intratextual multilingualism often manifest themselves in a way that can be referred to as interlingual slips. These slips may occur on different levels of language, for example phonetically: "*suur kirjandus, ahhaa! (ach!, haa!, ah, well, ai-jaaa,* / *ajaa, jjawohl, heh, heil, ja-ja, si, oui, jaaha, jahwe)*" (Viiding 2003: 33). But there are also semantic slips between different languages: "*aga vabadus mida saab osta ja müüa* / *maksab allkirja ja veel midagi midagi* / *väga väikest hinge hingekese* [---] *piimast ja uudseviljast selle hingekese* / *maksis vabadus svoboda priius freiheit* / *ja peale selle hulga tänukirju* / *tänupalveid tänulaule ja* / *tänulaulupidusid*" (but freedom that can be bought and sold / costs a signature and

something something else / a very small soul of a soul […] of milk and crop of this soul / cost freedom *svoboda* freedom freiheit / and on top of that a bunch of thankyou letters / thankyou prayers thankyou songs and / thankyou parties) (Kaplinski 1991: 24); "*prügi ja praht rämps sodi ja romu* / rubbish junk TRASH debris *ja* slime / *Tohuwabohu Wirrwarr ja Chaos*" (Krull 2001: 93). At the same time, the two possibilities are not entirely mutually exclusive, in some cases they also intertwine, for example, in Kaplinski's texts the words 'vabadus' and 'svoboda' form an internal rhyme while also being semantically equal; in a poem by Liisa Mudist, phonetic and semantic slips alternate: "*vull vull vee seest tõusev / michelangelo veenuse lokkide spiraalsus / ma tahan ma tahan ma tahan / ich will ich will / vull vull vull vull / full full on full on*" (bubble, bubble, rising out of the water / the spirals of the curls of michelangelo's venus / I want I want I want / *ich will ich will* / bubble, bubble, bubble, bubble / full full on full on) (Mudist 2019: 1). Often, such slips serve as a tool of emphasis, introducing a nuanced parallelism to the text: intralinguistic slips accentuate the semantic differences of similarly sounding languages, while intratextual slips point to different aspects of the same idea using homonymous expressions in different languages.

Estonian literary scholar Maie Kalda (2000: 121) has noted that while no continuous macaronic tradition has developed in Estonian poetry, it contains many macaronisms, i.e. expressions in mixed language on a smaller scale. Even today, consistently macaronic texts are rare, although there are a few examples. Among the most recent worth noting are two texts by Darya Popolitova (2021), which opened a special issue on Ida-Viru County of the culture newspaper *Müürileht*. Despite the consistently used code-mixing in these texts, a reader's language skills are not of primary importance here, the texts rather convey, through ambiguous connections, the Estonian-Russian speaking environment (in Tallinn): "*Мина олен естланэ. / Ütlen vanadele retuusidele lihtsalt tšaurakaa! / Интергацыоон – kakije seksualnõi kingad. / Рабарбар максаб – davai максуй tengi. / Суларахи нет, но есть кюсимусы. / / Plja, što takoi? / Где пальк? / – На Балтияме или в кескусе, / Там, где сок в топсике.*" (I am Estonian. / I'll just say to the old leggings bye-bye! / Integration – what sexy shoes! / *Rhubarb* costs *– let's make a payment. / There is no* cash*, but there are* questions*. / / Blyad, what's this? / Where's* the pay? / *At the Baltic Station or Downtown, / Where the juice is served in a little cup*) (Popolitova 2021). The macaronic methods used in these poems are more generally characteristic of contemporary poetry: the distortion of one language according to the rules of another (for example, writing Estonian in the Cyrillic alphabet or Russian in the Latin alphabet), loanwords, and so on.

Multilingualism in Estonian contemporary poetry can be broadly divided into two categories, or, to borrow a metaphor from Karl Ristikivi's (2003: 7) poem 'Kojuigatsus – kauguseigatsus' (Longing for Home – Longing for Remoteness), into a two-branched tree: poetry that relates to the locality (for example, embedding local languages) and poetry that relates to the globality or distance (for example, embedding distant languages into some local languages). Both branches include authors writing in several languages, intratextual code-switching, as well as examples of intralinguistic multilingualism. We could also tentatively distinguish between a situation in which multilingualism characterises the subject of the poetry, and a situation in which multilingualism is more of a feature of the environment that the subject experiences. In this way, multilingualism in contemporary poetry is related to the language proficiency of the local population and audience, on the one hand, and to the wider political and cultural function of the languages of the text, on the other. Kalda (2000: 121) has noted that mixed-language poetry can be seen as "a method that occasionally re-emerges in order to react to changes in or threats to the ethnic language, etc., while changing itself as well". In the context of Estonian literature as minor literature, language is constantly under scrutiny, subject to external influences, and thus to change.

Mart Velsker (2018: 437) argues that poetry speaking about language is rather common in the history of Estonian literature, more noticeably in the early days of the history of Estonian literature, but also now, in recently published poetry. He adds that composing poetry in mixed language holds a special role in poetry about language: "Is it not the case, after all, that the realisation of language takes place in an ordinary situation where familiar and unfamiliar voices and scripts meet each other? This gives rise to heightened regard for the mother tongue, the thoughts, and the play, for everything that poetry, infatuated with language, could still contain" (Velsker 2018: 437). Velsker's comment that language has only recently started to be reflected upon largely coincides with Belobrovtseva's (2018b: 19–20) observation that contemporary multilingualism operates against the backdrop of postmodernist fusion of borders and globalisation.

CONCLUSION

Estonian poetry has been multilingual throughout its history. Thus, the devices of multilingualism have also served different functions and found different forms of expression in poetry, among which the most prominent are the comic mixing of languages, the reflection of a socio-cultural situation or identity, the

establishing of cultural contacts through translation, and interlanguage parallelism. In early Estonian poetry, the most prominent feature of multilingualism was author-based multilingualism (exophony): authors who spoke several languages wrote poetry alternating between one language and another. In the 17th century, Estonian emerged among the languages of poetry on the wave of the humanistic, enlightened poetry tradition, the authors and the target audience of which were educated people who spoke several languages. In the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, poems in Estonian were mainly written by German-speaking intellectuals with an aim to educate the Estonian-speaking population: poetry was seen as a means of moral and aesthetic education. At the same time, poets of Estonian origin could use the more prestigious German language in addition to Estonian (e.g., K. J. Peterson, Aksel Kallas). Intratextual and intralinguistic multilingualism are rather rare in early Estonian poems, while intralinguistic multilingualism is characteristic of Baltic-German poetry, where it was mainly used in a humorous, parodic vein.

After the Second World War, composing poetry in several languages became a characteristic feature of exile literature. In homeland Estonia, exophonic poets were an exception, and intratextual and intralinguistic multilingualism was found in the works of only a very few poets (e.g., Jaan Kross, Eha Lättemäe). In contemporary poetry, multilingualism is highly common and quite diverse. In addition to Estonian, Russian, English and the local dialects are the most common languages used in the poetry scene today, while the use of German has declined, compared to earlier literature. The multilingual nature of contemporary literature, and especially the multilingual poets' code-switching (for example, in the case of Jaan Kaplinski), has raised important questions about defining literature as monolingual. Quotations and loans stand out among the devices of mixed language in contemporary literature, while intratextual multilingualism is most often found in the form of phrases and parallel poems in other languages. The impact of multilingualism in poetry strongly depends on whether local languages are juxtaposed (for example, Estonian and Russian in the work of Igor Kotyukh) or more distant languages are used (as in the poetry of the poets and translators Maarja Kangro and Kalju Kruusa), although in both cases the text refers to the local social and cultural function of the languages used. Thus, on the one hand, the multilingualism of contemporary poetry can be explained by globalisation and the fact that people's increased mobility has led to the acquisition of different languages; on the other hand, artistic play and the post-modernist attempt to transgress and fuse borders also contribute to the abundance of languages in literature. Thirdly, multilingualism in modern poetry can be linked to the linguistic diversity that has prevailed in the territory of Estonia throughout the ages.

Literary history seeks to reflect the literary process, in which inevitably texts emerge that shape the turning points and push literary culture forward. Manifestations of multilingualism always prompt the question of what kind of literature they belong to, which means that both the literary cultures in other languages and multilingual authors may remain peripheral in the core literary process. The methods of multilingualism in contemporary literature, however, demonstrate that the use of different languages is characteristic even of the authors who mainly write in Estonian. Therefore, we believe that the manifestations of literary multilingualism could be included in several literary histories, including the history of Estonian literature, which could also include chapters on Baltic-German and Russian literature published in Estonia, macaronic poetry, and exophonic authors.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The article is one of the outputs of the Estonian Research Council's (ERC) personal research funding team grant The Factor of Lyrical Poetry in the Formation of Minor Literatures (PRG1106).

We are grateful to Sirje Kiin, Mariko Faster, and Mart Velsker for their useful tips. The article was supported by the European Union through the European Regional Development Fund (the Centre of Excellence in Estonian Studies, TK 145).

NOTES

[1] Multilingualism in oral poetry and folklore is an interesting topic in its own right, but falls outside the scope of this paper, see further in Kõiva 2014. It also excludes slam poetry, where in recent years notable poets of Finnish origin have emerged, such as Heidi Iivari, who has now published a bilingual collection of poetry in Finnish, *Tarton sarjarakastaja / Tartu sariarmastaja* (The serial lover of Tartu, 2021), and Iina Gyldén.

[2] Similarly, Stefan Helgesson has recently highlighted the fact that studies of literary multilingualism tend to focus on one level out four: author, text, reader, or the larger social context (Helgesson 2022).

[3] For ease of understanding, if the quotes are translated, then the different languages used in them will be marked in translations as follows: 1st language is unmarked, 2nd language is in cursive, 3rd language is underlined with one line, and 4th language underlined with two lines. In Baltic German examples, Estonian is marked with a translation in the footnotes. The use of multiple scripts to write in one language (e.g. using Cyrillic for Estonian words) will not be marked in the translations.

[4] Language theorists have distinguished between latent and manifest forms of language diversity (Dembeck & Parr 2017). According to Dembeck, manifest multilingualism

refers to language alternation in a text, for example, when untranslatable compounds are used in a literal sense. For example, in Sveta Grigoryeva's poem 'Court queen 4 ever': "*ole tema esimese korruse rõdualune / kus on igaveseks kustunud odava markeriga kirjutatud / саша + света 4 ever*" ('be someone living under her first-floor balcony/where it is written with a cheap marker, forever faded / *саша + света 4 ever*') (Grigoryeva 2020 [2013]: 27). Latent multilingualism refers to situations in which one character in a text speaks another language and this is marked accordingly in the narrator's voice, for example, "he said in English". It also refers to text passages which are intended to be in another language but are conveyed in the language in which the text is composed (for example, a letter in a foreign language, headlines or signs in a foreign city, etc.), as in one of Grigoryeva's untitled poems: "*seal kus liigse naeru ja lapselikkuse eest saadetakse / ikka korralikult keset hoovi vales keeles perse*" (where for too much laughter and childishness, one is told / still properly in the middle of the courtyard to go fuck oneself in the wrong language) (Grigoryeva 2020 [2013]: 34). Our focus here is on manifest forms of multilingualism.

[5] The term 'literary translingualism' is also often used to more explicitly encompass both exophonic and otherwise multilingual literature (see Kellman & Lvovich 2022).

[6] Dialectal poetry in the context of multilingualism in Estonian poetry deserves individual attention and will not be discussed in this article.

[7] Est. 'stables'.

[8] Est. 'sleigh'.

[9] Est. 'ash and dust' ('at lightning speed').

[10] Est. 'at great speed'.

[11] Est. 'one, two, three'.

[12] 'One, two, three' in broken Estonian.

[13] Switching between Estonian and Russian in Kaplinski's (and Igor Kotyukh's) poetry has previously been studied by Irina Belobrovtseva (2018b), and by Ekaterina Yashina (2017, 2019) in her bachelor's and master's theses.

[14] The text in Estonian is spelled in Cyrillic: "we speak different languages, but we are still the same people, the mirrors and reflections of each other".

[15] *Niao* – they want 'a bird' if said with a falling-rising tonal pattern, or 'to have a pee' with a falling tone (Author's note in the original – S. L. L.).

REFERENCES

Aabrams, Vahur 2007. *"Mehr nurrige Gesicht". Vier Gedichte in estnischem Halbdeutsch aus einer karnevalesken Umbruchzeit*. Manuscript, MA thesis. Department of Germanic Studies, University of Tartu.

Ariste, Paul 1981. Keelekontaktid. Eesti keele kontakte teiste keeltega. [Language Contacts. Contacts of Estonian Language With Other Languages.] *Emakeele Seltsi toimetised* 14. Tallinn: Valgus.

Arndt, Susan & Naguschewski, Dirk & Stockhammer, Robert (eds.) 2007. *Exophonie. Anders-Sprachigkeit (in) der Literatur*. Berlin: Kulturverlag Kadmos.

Belobrovtseva, Irina 2018a. Vene kirjandus Eestis: eile ja täna. [Russian Literature in Estonian: Past and Resent.] *Looming*, No. 1, pp. 102–121.

Belobrovtseva, Irina 2018b. The Bilingual Writer: Two Estonian-Russian Cases and One Russian-Estonian Case. *Methis*, No. 21/22, pp. 8–25. https://doi.org/10.7592/methis.v17i21/22.14582.

Belobrovtseva, Irina 2020. Oma ja võõras: vene kirjandus Eestis aastail 1946–1953. [Own and Others: Russian Literature in Estonia in 1946–1953.] *Vikerkaar*, No. 4–5, pp. 73–84.

Bender, Reet 2022. Baltisaksa keelest ja kolmest kohalikust keelest. [On Baltic German Language and the Three Local Languages.] In: Inna Põltsam-Jürjo & Jüri Kivimäe (eds.) *Kultuur ja rahvas. Mälestusteos Ea Jansenile* [Culture and People. In commemoration of Ea Jansen.] Tartu: Rahvusarhiiv, pp. 39–67.

Cullen, Adam 2017. *Lichen / Samblik*. Tallinn: Näo Kirik.

Dembeck, Till 2021. Heute sprechen. Literatur, Politik und andere Sprachen im Lied (Herder, Alunāns, Barons). *Interlitteraria* 26/1, pp. 31–48.

Dembeck, Till & Parr, Rolf (eds.) 2017. *Literatur und Mehrsprachigkeit. Ein Handbuch*. Tübingen: Narr/Francke/Attempto.

Ehin, Kristiina 2000. *Kevad Astrahanis*. [Spring in Astrakhan.] Tallinn: Huma.

Eisenreich, Herbert 1967. Vorwort. *Ivar Ivask, Gespiegelte Erde. Gedichte 1953–1963*. New York: Frederick Ungar Publishing Co., pp. 5–7.

Fleming, Paul 1636 = *Lieffländische Schneegräfinn*. Auff H. Andres Rüttings, Vnd Jungfr. Annen von Holten Hochzeit. Revall.

Grigoryeva, Sveta 2020 [2013]. *Kes kardab Sveta Grigorjevat?* [Who's Afraid of Sveta Grigoryeva?] Tallinn: Kultuurileht SA.

Hasselblatt, Cornelius 1997. Der Gedanke der Kulturautonomie und seine gesetzliche und organisatorische Verwirklichung. In: Boris Meissner & Dietrich A. Loeber & Cornelius Hasselblatt (eds.) *Die deutsche Volksgruppe in Estland während der Zwischenkriegszeit und aktuelle Fragen des deutsch-estnischen Verhältnisses*. Hamburg: Bibliotheca Baltica, pp. 37–46.

Hasselblatt, Cornelius 2006. *Geschichte der estnischen Literatur. Von den Anfängen bis zur Gegenwart*. Berlin–New York: Walter de Gruyter. https://doi.org/10.1515/9783110201673.

Helgesson, Stefan 2022. Regimes of Comprehensibility: A Perspectival Approach to Literary Multilingualism. *Apples – Journal of Applied Language Studies*, Vol. 16, No. 3, pp. 1–10. https://doi.org/10.47862/apples.115265.

Kalda, Maie 2000. Jacob Johann Malm ja makarooniline luule. [Jacob Johann Malm and Macaronic Poetry.] In: Maie Kalda *Mis mees ta on?* [Who Is He?] Collegium litterarum 12. Tallinn: Under and Tuglas Literature Centre, pp. 82–149.

Kaldmaa, Kätlin 2020. Kasuemakeel. [Stepmother Tongue.] *Sirp*, May 29, pp. 12–13.

Kangro, Maarja 2013. *Must tomat*. [Black Tomato.] Tallinn: Eesti Keele Sihtasutus.

Kangro, Maarja 2019. *Tuul*. [Wind.] Tallinn: Nähtamatu Ahv.

Kaplinski, Jaan 1991. *Hinge tagasitulek*. [The Soul Returning.] Tallinn: Eesti Raamat.

Kaplinski, Jaan 2010. Goodbye My Estonian. *Ummamuudu*. Available at http://jaankaplinski.blogspot.com/2010/12/goodbye-my-estonian.html, last accessed on 27 January 2023.

Kaur, Kairit 2009. Baltisaksa naiste juhuluulest XVII sajandi keskpaigast XVIII sajandi lõpuni. [On Occasional Poetry of Baltic German Women from the Mid-17th Century to the Late 18th Century.] *Keel ja Kirjandus*, No. 1, pp. 11–32.

Kaur, Kairit 2011. Baltisaksa naiste esimesed luulekogud ja -põimikud. [The First Poetry Books and Collections of Baltic German Women.] *Keel ja Kirjandus*, Nos. 8–9, pp. 614–627.

Kellman, Steven G. & Natasha Lvovich (eds.) 2022. *The Routledge Handbook of Literary Translingualism*. Routledge Literature Handbooks. New York, London: Routledge.

Kitzberg, August 1915. *Külajutud III. (Eesti Kirjanikkude Seltsi "Noor-Eesti" toimetus 36.).* [Village Tales III (Estonian Writers' Society 'Young Estonia' Edition 36).] Tartu: Noor-Eesti.

Kivisilla, Veronika 2019. *Salutatio!* Luige: Verb.

Klöker, Martin 2014. Tallinna kirjanduselu 17. sajandi esimesel poolel (1600–1657). Haridusinstitutsioonid ja juhuluuletamine. [Tallinn's Literary Scene in the First Half of the 17th Century (1600–1657). Educational Institutions and Occasional Poetry Writing.] Tallinn: Estonian Academy Publishers.

Kõiva, Mare 2014. Multilinguality and Code Change in Incantations. In: Mare Kõiva *Through the Ages. Time, Space and Eternity*. Tartu: ELM Scholarly Press, pp. 131–142.

Kotyukh, Igor 2007. *Teises keeles.* [In Another Language.] Transl. by I. Kotyukh and A. Pilv. Tallinn: Tuum.

Kotyukh, Igor 2012. Eesti venekeelne kirjandus: kas osa eesti või vene kirjandusest? [Russian Literature of Estonia: Part of Estonian or Russian Literature?] *Keel ja Kirjandus*, No. 2, pp. 134–139. https://doi.org/10.54013/kk651a4.

Kotyukh, Igor 2013. Eesti venekeelse kirjanduse nullindate põlvkond: vastuvõtt ja tõrked omaks tunnistamisel. [The Generation of the 2000s in the Russian Literature of Estonia: Acceptance and Obstacles to Acknowledgement.] *Methis*, No. 11, pp. 64–83. https://doi.org/10.7592/methis.v8i11.1002.

Kotyukh, Igor 2017a. *Estestvenno osobennyj slučaj = Estestvenno osobennyj slutchaj.* [A Naturally Special Incident.] Paide: Kite.

Kotyukh, Igor 2017b. Loomulikult eriline lugu. [A Naturally Special Incident.] Transl. by A. Pilv. Tallinn: Tuum.

Kotyukh, Igor 2020. Andrei Ivanovi teoste retseptsioon ja Eesti venekeelse kirjanduse identiteedi kujunemine. [The Reception of Andrei Ivanov's Works and the Formation of Identity in Estonian Russian Literature.] MA thesis. Tallinn: Institute of the Humanities, Tallinn University.

Kraavi, Janek 2022. Proosast ülevaatlikult. [Overview of Prose.] *Looming*, No. 2, pp. 251–268.

Krull, Hasso 2001. *Kornukoopia.* [Cornucopia.] Tallinn: Vagabund.

Kruusa, Kalju 2010. *Tühhja.* [Nothing.] Tallinn: Ussimunni.

Kruusa, Kalju 2013. *灵血茶 (ing•veri•tee).* [gin•ger•tea.] Tallinn: Säutsipau.

Lotman, Rebekka & Lotman, Miikael-Aadam 2014. Üks imetleb kuud, teine imeb näppu. [One Admires the Moon, Another Sucks the Thumb.] *Keel ja Kirjandus*, No. 4, pp. 304–308.

Lukas, Liina 2002. Ühest hääbuvast maailmast. Baltisaksa kirjanduslikke identiteedikontseptsioone Eesti Vabariigi ajal. [On a Disappearing World. Baltic

German Literary Conceptualisations of Identity During the Republic of Estonia.] *Keel ja Kirjandus*, No. 3, pp. 153–164.

Lukas, Liina 2006. *Baltisaksa kirjandusväli 1890–1918.* [Baltic German Literary Culture 1890–1918.] Tartu: University of Tartu Press.

Lukas, Liina (ed.) 2021. *Balti kirjakultuuri ajalugu I. Keskused ja kandjad.* [History of Baltic Literary Culture I. Centres and Transmitters.] Tartu: University of Tartu Press.

Malm, Jacob Johann 1861. *Die Oberpahlsche Freundschaft*. Reval: [Estländ. Gouvernements-Typographie].

Mudist, Liisa 2019. * ei sellest ei saa asja, Kuidas kirjutada "öö", * Sylvia, myriam, keegi veel, * Foto: fotol ol ol ol olen alles. [* no this won't do. How to write "öö", * Sylvia, myriam, someone else, * Photo: I am am am still there on the photo.] *Värske Rõhk*, No. 61, pp. 1–6.

Olesk, Sirje 2014 = Olesk, Sir'e. Jaan Kaplinskii – emigrant, kotoryj ne emigriroval [Jaan Kaplinski – the Emigrant Who Didn't Emigrate.] *Lotmanovskij sbornik 4*. Moscow: OGI, pp. 606–616.

Pajević, Marko (ed.) 2020. *Mehrsprachigkeit und das Politische. Interferenzen in zeitgenössischer deutschsprachiger und baltischer Literatur*. Tübingen: Narr/Francke/Attempto.

Pilv, Aare 1998. *Päike ehk päike: vanaaegset luulet 1993–1997.* [The Sun or the Sun: Old Poetry, 1993–1997.] Tallinn: Erakkond.

Pilv, Aare 2018. Saatesõna. [Foreword.] *Valged ööliblikad. Wegeneri naeratus.* [White Butterflies of Night. Wegener's Smile.] Transl. by A. Pilv & K. Väli. Luige: Verb, pp. 132–139.

Pilv, Aare 2022. Kas eesti kirjandus areneb? [Is Estonian Literature Developing?] *Looming*, No. 12, pp. 1702–1707.

Popolitova, Darya 2021. *Mina olen estlane, ** Što nada. [*I Am Estonian, ** What Do You Need.] *Müürileht*, No. 112, p. 3.

Rangøy, Øyvind 2019. *Sisikond.* [Viscera.] Tallinn: Vihmakass ja kakerdaja.

Ristikivi, Karl 2003. *Inimese teekond. Luuletusi.* [A Man's Journey. Poems.] Tallinn: Varrak.

Soovik, Ene-Reet 2016. Euroopa hääl ja keel. [Europe's Voice and Language.] *Sirp*, 19 February, p. 7.

Stern, Maurice 1911. *Wildfeuer. Neue Verse*. Leipzig: Verlag des literarischen Bulletin.

Statistikaamet 2022. Tabel: *RL214492: rahvastik keeleoskuse, soo, vanuserühma ja elukoha (asustuspiirkond) järgi, 31. detsember 2021*. [Table RL214492: Population According to Language Skills, Gender, Age and Place of Residence (Region).] Available at https://andmed.stat.ee/et/stat/rahvaloendus__rel2021__rahvastiku-demograafilised-ja-etno-kultuurilised-naitajad__voorkeeleoskus-murded/RL214492, last accessed on 27 January 2023.

Sukhovei, Darya 2008. Tänapäeva venekeelsest luulest Eestis. [On Contemporary Russian Poetry in Estonia.] *Vikerkaar* 4–5, pp. 62–70.

Talvet, Jüri 2005. Maailmakirjanduse kodustamise küsimusi. [Issues of Domesticating World Literature.] *Keel ja Kirjandus*, No. 6, pp. 433–441.

Trunin, Mikhail 2018. Loomuliku keele otsingul. [In Search of the Natural Language.] *Sirp*, 6 July, pp. 17–18.

Undusk, Jaan 1992. Saksa-eesti kirjandussuhete tüpoloogia. [Typology of German-Estonian Literary Relations.] *Keel ja Kirjandus*, No. 10, pp. 583–594; No. 11, pp. 645–656; No. 12, pp. 709–725.

Väljataga, Märt 2021. Üks korralik kirjandus? [A Proper Literature?] *Looming*, No. 10, pp. 1411–1419.

Velsker, Mart 2014. *Lõunaeesti kirjandusloo kirjutamise võimalusi.* [Alternatives for Writing the South Estonian Literary History.] Tartu: University of Tartu Press.

Velsker, Mart 2018. Kuidas luuletatakse keelest? [How Does One Write Poetry About Language?] In: Mart Velsker & Tõnu Tender (ed.) *Keele maitsest. Luuleantoloogia*. Tallinn: EKSA, pp. 429–439.

Velsker, Mart 2019. Keelele keskendunud lõunaeesti luule. [South Estonian Poetry Focused on Language.] In: Eva Saar & Karl Pajusalu & Mart Velsker (eds.) *Tartu Ülikooli Lõuna-Eesti keele- ja kultuuriuuringute keskuse aastaraamat XVII–XVIII*. [Yearbook of the Centre for South Estonian Language and Culture Studies XIX–XX.] Lõuna-Eesti sõnas ja pildis. Tartu: University of Tartu Press, pp. 39–48.

Velsker, Mart 2021a. Seitse tähelepanekut lõunaeesti kirjanduse kahekümnest aastast. [Seven Observations on the Twenty Year History of South Estonian Literature.] In: Eva Saar & Karl Pajusalu & Mart Velsker (eds.) *Tartu Ülikooli Lõuna-Eesti keele- ja kultuuriuuringute keskuse aastaraamat XIX–XX*. [Yearbook of the Centre for South Estonian Language and Culture Studies XIX–XX.] Tartu: University of Tartu Press, pp. 11–23.

Velsker, Mart 2021b. *Võru kirjanduse kujunemislugu.* [Evolution History of Literature in Võru.] Võru: Võru Institute.

Velsker, Mart 2022. Ärevalt rahulik. [Anxiously Calm.] *Looming*, No. 1, pp. 115–124.

Verschik, Anna 2012. Keelekontaktide uurimise võlu (ja kasu). [The Pleasure (and Benefits) of Studying Language Contacts.] *Keel ja Kirjandus*, Nos. 8–9, pp. 658–673.

Viiding, Elo 2003. *Teatud erandid.* [Certain Exceptions.] Tallinn: Tuum.

Viiding, Kristi & Orion, Jana & Päll, Janika 2007. *O Dorpat, urbs addictissima musis... Valik 17. sajandi Tartu juhuluulet.* [A Selection of 17th-Century Occasional Poetry from Tartu.] Tallinn: Estonian Language Foundation.

Viiding, Kristi 2005. Õnnelik olgu su samm... Teelesaatmisluuletused 17. sajandi Eesti kirjanduses. [May You Tread Lightly… Farewell Poems in 17th-Century Estonian Literature.] *Keel ja Kirjandus*, No. 5, pp. 359–378; No. 6, pp. 455–474.

Viiding, Kristi 2014. Tähekleidis öö. Uurimus Põhja-Baltikumi naisluule kohta enne Koidulat. [Night in a Dress Made of Stars. A Study on the North Baltic Women's Poetry Before Lydia Koidula.] *Keel ja Kirjandus*, No. 1, pp. 63–66.

Viires, Piret 2022. Eesti kirjanduse ajaloo koostajale mõeldes. [Thinking about the Compiler of an Estonian Literary History.] *Looming*, No. 4, pp. 543–550.

Yashina 2017 = Belozerova, Ekaterina. *Bilingvizm v literature Estonii: pisateli bilingvy Igor' Kotjuh i Jan Kaplinskij.* [Bilingualism in Estonian Literature: Bilingual Works by Igor Kotyukh and Jaan Kaplinski.] BA thesis. Tallinn: Institute of the Humanities, Tallinn University.

Yashina, Ekaterina 2019. "Svoe i chuzhoe": literaturnyj bilingvizm v sovremennoj kul'ture Estonii (sluchai Igorja Kotjuha). [Own and Others: Literary Bilinguism in Estonian Contemporary Culture (On the Example of Igor Kotyukh).] MA thesis. Tallinn: Institute of the Humanities, Tallinn University.

Yildiz, Yasemin 2012. *Beyond the Mother Tongue: The Postmonolingual Condition*. New York: Fordham University Press. https://doi.org/10.2307/j.ctt13x0cqr.

Saara Lotta Linno is junior research fellow in comparative literature at the University of Tartu. Her research on literary multilingualism started with her master's thesis, in which she analysed the possibilities of multilingual and multicultural mechanisms of meaning-making based on six texts by contemporary Estonian poets. Currently, she is writing her doctoral thesis on the multilingual poetics of Estonian poetry in the 20th and 21st century.

saara.lotta.linno@ut.ee

Liina Lukas is professor of comparative literature at the University of Tartu. Her research focuses on literary relations in the multilingual Baltic cultural area, especially German-Estonian literary relations from the 18th to the early 20th century. Since 2001, she has organised international symposia on Baltic literary culture, which have brought together scholars from different disciplines and countries interested in Baltic cultural history. She is the editor-in-chief of the eight-volume collective monograph "The History of Baltic Literary Culture" (Volume 1 was published in 2021) and has initiated the digital text repository of early Baltic literatures EEVA. She is the head of the Estonian Comparative Literature Association and of the Estonian Goethe-Society; she is the corresponding member of the Göttingen Academy of Sciences.

liina.lukas@ut.ee